

# City Council

**Monday 21 November 2022**

## **PRESENT:**

Councillor Dann, in the Chair.

Councillor Penberthy, Vice Chair.

Councillors Mrs Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Bingley, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Burden, Carlyle, Churchill, Coker, Collins, Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Deacon, Drear, Evans OBE, Finn, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Lowry, Lugg, Dr Mahony, McDonald, Murphy, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Poyser, Reilly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Singh, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tofan, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Wakeham, Ms Watkin and Wheeler.

Apologies for absence: Councillors Allen and Mrs Bowyer.

The meeting started at 2.00 pm and finished at 9.00 pm.

*Note: The full discussion can be viewed on the webcast of the City Council meeting at [www.plymouth.gov.uk](http://www.plymouth.gov.uk). At a future meeting, the Council will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.*

## 15. **Minutes**

The Committee agreed the minutes of the Ordinary and Extraordinary meetings held on 20 June 2022 and 30 September 2022 as a correct record.

## 16. **Declarations of Interest**

The following declarations of interest were made by councillors in accordance with the code of conduct in respect of items under consideration at the meeting -

<b>Name</b>	<b>Minute Number</b>	<b>Reason</b>	<b>Interest</b>
Councillor Dr Charlotte Cree	22	Member of the Local Government Pension Scheme.	Private
Councillor Dan Collins	34	Item concerned their position as a Councillor.	Non-registerable
Councillor Shannon Burden	34	Item concerned their position as a Councillor.	Non-registerable
Councillor Natalie Harrison	31 & 33	Affected those the Councillor works with.	Private
Councillor George	22	Councillor was in receipt of a Local	Private

Wheeler		Government Pension.	
Councillor Patrick Nicholson	22	Deferred Member of the Local Government Pension Scheme.	Private
Councillor Mark Lowry	22	Deferred Member of the Local Government Pension Scheme.	Private
Councillor James Stoneman	22	Father was employed by the local authority.	Private
Lord Mayor Councillor Sue Dann	22	Family Member was employed by the local authority.	Private
Councillor Sue McDonald	22	Deferred Member of the Local Government Pension Scheme.	Private
Councillor Zoe Reilly	22	Family Member was employed by the local authority.	Private
Councillor Bill Stevens	29	Councillor works for Devon and Cornwall Police.	Private
Councillor Ian Darcy	29	Councillor works for Devon and Cornwall Police.	Private
Councillor Patrick Nicholson	29	Councillor works as a magistrate considering non-molestation orders.	Private

#### 17. **Political Proportionality and Appointments to Committees**

Following a question from Councillor Nicholson it was clarified that –

- a) The Lord Mayors Selection Committee was a committee of Council and therefore fell under the Local Government Act 1972 and had to be proportional;
- b) The change had been made at the AGM on 20 May 2022 to include it in proportionality.

The Council agreed the changes to committee membership following changes in the political proportionality of the Council.

#### 18. **Questions by the Public**

The following questions were asked by Members of the Public.

The following question was asked by Mr Roy Hamilton	
Question: In my opinion the PCC Taxi	Response: The Growth and

<p>Policy 2022, either deliberately or through unforeseen circumstances, is destroying the Plymouth Taxi Trade. When will the Licensing Authority meet with knowledgeable persons and Licensees who understand the economics and infrastructure of the Taxi and Private Hire Trades as promised during March, 2022?</p>	<p>Infrastructure Overview and Scrutiny Committee will establish a select committee to review the implementation of the Taxi Policy 2022.</p> <p>This will take place in the early part of the new year.</p> <p>Knowledgeable persons and licensees will be invited to take part in that review.</p>
<p>The following question was asked by Mr Alan Ramage</p>	
<p>Question: The U.N. Secretary General says that banks and financiers have the future of humanity by the throat. Will PCC publicise Bank.Green (a Green Finance Pressure Group) so Plymouthians can choose a bank that has low fossil fuel project investments. This complements PCC's climate emergency. How does PCC's bank fare when assessed for green credentials?</p>	<p>Response: Plymouth City Council bank with Barclays Bank and who are fully committed to achieving their ambition of being a net zero bank by 2050.</p> <p>Their Green Bonds highlights their commitment to placing green principles at their core and their Green Issuance Framework which was published in July 2021 and has been externally reviewed by the Carbon Trust.</p>
<p>The following question was asked by Mr Stuart Dolton</p>	
<p>Question: Does Plymouth City Council, in acknowledging its Memorandum to Parliament (CEM 48), care enough about Plymouth's heritage to ensure adequate finance and resources are provided to meet its obligation of keeping closed churchyards within our community in decent order, as legally required under the Local Government Act 1972?</p>	<p>Response: Yes, Plymouth City Council are aware of their responsibilities of the closed churchyards and regular maintenance is assured.</p> <p>If they are concerns regarding any closed cemetery that Plymouth City Council maintains we would ask that a report is made via the Plymouth City Council feedback form.</p>
<p>The following question was asked by Mr Mike Sheaff</p>	
<p>Question: Plymouth City Council's external auditors explain the decision not to increase council tax for 2022/23, "will start to build a cumulative loss of income that is not sustainable". Yet the proposal was not considered in the pre-budget scrutiny report. How will more meaningful scrutiny of proposals be achieved for 2023/24?</p>	<p>Response: The budget report itself contained a statement from the S151 Officer setting out that prior to the budget discussion Cabinet had received advice that the opportunities to maximise the yield of Council Tax and the Adult Social Care Precept are in the Council's immediate and long term interests from a financial viewpoint.</p>

	<p>The decision to not raise the Council Tax for 2022/23 was agreed as an amendment at the Council meeting itself and was therefore not subject to pre-scrutiny. All opportunities are taken at budget scrutiny sessions to be clear on the implications of different council tax decisions.</p>
<p>The following question was asked by Mr Michael Smith</p>	
<p>Question: Why is Smeaton's tower closing over winter while this icon tower is synonymous with Plymouth Hoe? If we close attractions how will we encourage tourists? Plymouth doesn't close for winter. Previously we have had weekend winter opening.</p>	<p>Response: We opened Smeaton's Tower over the winter whilst The Box was closed, to provide a visitor facing offer as part of our Museum on Tour programme.</p> <p>However, winter footfall and income was not high enough to cover the costs of the two members of staff needed and we therefore took the decision, in consultation with the lead Member for culture, not to continue to operate the building at a loss during the low season. The closure also provides us with time to undertake essential maintenance of this Grade I listed building.</p> <p>Summer opening hours have been extended to cover the period Easter to the end of October half term, however and the tower welcomes many tourist visitors during this busy time for the city.</p>
<p>The following question was asked by Mr Clive Persil</p>	
<p>Question: How it has been possible for PCC to fail to ensure that James Brent deliver on his commitment to supply a new ice rink and how much money has been paid to James Brent and any company to which is a director during his tenure as owner of the Pavilions?</p>	<p>Response: We are genuinely sad to see the closure of the ice rink as we know that committed skaters, staff, the coaching staff as well as casual users will be bitterly disappointed with this decision.</p> <p>The Council sold the Pavilions site in 2012 to Five Directions Ltd (a company owned by James Brent) and it is disappointing that a new ice rink has not been provided during this time. However, the Council recognises the efforts that were made to progress this</p>

	<p>before the Covid-19 pandemic with planning consent granted for a new scheme in 2013 and then again in 2018.</p> <p>We also appreciate that running an ice rink is not the cheapest of ventures and that this has been made even more challenging with recent energy cost increases. We had historically subsidised the Pavilions site to the tune of around £1.5million a year. This cost to the tax payer was a key reason we entered (following a procurement process) into a 10-year agreement with Five Directions Ltd in 2012 to run the events arena and ice rink. This agreement ended at the end of September.</p> <p>The original agreement between the Council and Five Directions Ltd included a payment of £2,000,000 from the Council to support the provision of services at the Pavilions over the course of the last 10 years. No other payments have been made, other than grants that were made available to leisure operators during the COVID-19 pandemic to provide short term support for their operations.</p>
The following question was asked by Mr David Cann	
Question: Why are you constantly defending 2 absent councillors living in Gloucestershire? Could you explain to the council and more importantly the tax payers of Plymouth why they moved away and why they don't both stand down?	<p>Response: I have not attempted to defend the two councillors who have chosen to live in Gloucestershire.</p> <p>They have acted within the law and it is not appropriate for me to discuss their personal motivations of their relocation.</p>
The following question was asked by Mr James Dyson	
Question: Given that it's becoming increasingly clear how unpopular the removal of all but one of the trees between the Sundial and North Cross Roundabout is with the people of Plymouth, would the Council agree to temporarily pause the project, making a	Response: I can advise that the City Council has agreed to a short pause on the project so that the concerns that have recently been raised can be considered before the final design is completed.

new plan incorporating as many existing trees as possible?	<p>It should be pointed that in the previous consultation on Armada Way there was 84% positive feedback on the scheme. The project is a Transforming Cities Fund sustainable transport project which has many wider benefits which will support the regeneration of the city centre as it faces many difficult challenges in the coming years.</p> <p>I can also confirm that there will be no further trees removed whilst the concerns from the public are considered further and the designs finalised.</p>

## 19. **Announcements**

With great sadness, The Lord Mayor informed The Council of the passing of Alderman Tom Jones, Alderman David James and former Councillor Tony Kirk.

The Council held a minutes silence as a show of respect.

The Leader gave his announcements and highlighted –

- a) Plymouth was now legally a Freeport and had been awarded its statutory instrument for the final tax sites, making Plymouth the first Freeport up and running;
- b) There was a significant amount of interest from investors for Plymouths Freeport sites with deals to be announced in the future;
- c) The advertisement for the Chair and CEO of Freeport had been announced with hopes to recruit before Christmas 2022;
- d) In October 2022, the Smart Sound Connect Control Centre was opened to further enhance the ocean-focussed 5G network testbed in and around Plymouth Sound and the network had won the 2022 Mobile Industry Award for 5G Innovation of the Year;
- e) Two applications had been submitted to the Regulators Pioneer Fund and Innovate UK with partners across the South West Region which if successful would support marine innovation and create opportunities for businesses to innovate and grow;
- f) The Council has reached out to the British Business Bank to ensure that Plymouth Businesses had maximum awareness and success at securing investment from the £200 million South West Fund which would be launched in 2023;

- g) The Leader was impressed and proud to inform Council that some major, overseas owned companies in Plymouth were continuing to win multi-million pound contracts and creating thousands of high value jobs;
- h) Princess Anne had visited Plymouth to open the National Centre for Coastal Autonomy;
- i) Plymouth had hosted the MDL Green Tech Boat Show for the second year in a row, which celebrated the green alternatives in traditional boating tech with it being profiled in the Event of the Year category in the British Yachting Awards
- j) Destination Plymouth had been doing extensive work to promote the city at various trade shows and new hotels were being built to encourage more tourists and visitors to come to the city;
- k) Plymouth International Medical and Technology Park had launched the latest development to market – Barrack Court, a 40,000sq ft new development of high quality units and offices;
- l) Congratulated Councillor Dan Collins and Councillor Shannon Burden following the news they would be having a baby, and explained that they had both indicated that they would be stepping down as Councillors in May 2023 and thanked them for their contribution to date.

Councillor Jonathan Drear (Cabinet Member for Transport) provided an update and highlighted –

- m) The construction work on the first Transforming Cities Fund Mobility Hub had begun;
- n) Thanked all Members who had contributed to decisions around contents and location for the Connect Plymouth project;
- o) Heavy rainfall had caused a number of issues across Plymouth in recent weeks and a co-ordinated approach was being taken between Plymouth City Council, The Environment Agency and South West Water to look at capacity issues;
- p) Inspections with cameras into drains were being undertaken to try and determine the cause of issues in some areas with a report due in the following week.

Councillor James Stoneman (Cabinet Member for Climate Change) provided an update and highlighted –

- q) That Cabinet had approved development funding for the proposed Solar Farm at Chelson Meadow which would allow a final business case to be developed for the 13.6 Mega Watt solar farm to be built on the north edge of the city's old landfill site;
- r) The Councillor's Hub had launched and would replace the existing Councillor Toolkit and enable Councillors to have a single location to access key information, training opportunities, digital forms, the committee calendar & webcasts.

Councillor Rebecca Smith (Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning, Homes and Communities) provided an update and highlighted –

- s) Plymouth City Council had successfully secured White Ribbon status, recognising work done in the city to prevent violence against women and girls;
- t) In a joint bid Plymouth, South Hams and West Devon Councils' had been awarded a further £200,000 of grant funding from the Department of Levelling Up Housing and Communities to develop digital planning capability and engagement tools and it was one of only 9 bids approved for the PropTech engagement fund;
- u) The council had submitted a bid to the second wave of government Social Housing Decarbonisation Fund with the aim of securing over £17.4 million of new investment into affordable homes in the city, in partnership with Plymouth Community Homes and LiveWest to deliver significant reductions in energy costs, improved thermal comfort and lower carbon emissions for 725 homes in some of Plymouth's most deprived neighbourhoods;

Councillor Bill Wakeham (Cabinet Member for Environment and Street Scene) provided an update and highlighted –

- v) A subscription-based garden waste collection service would be launching soon with an “early-bird” cost of £39 for the first eight weeks, increasing to £49 thereafter and if residents no longer wanted their black bins they could return them to Chelson Meadow or pay a covering charge of £10 for collection;
- w) There would be a subsidy for compost bins of £10 off of the recommended retail price;
- x) Non-Household Waste charges would be re-introduced to bring PCC costs in line with other local authorities;
- y) Teams were working continually to clear leaf fall to try to keep flooding hot spots clear;
- z) Final grass cuts had been completed in all residential areas and the final remaining meadows would be completed by the end of November;
- aa) There had been another successful year with the re-wilding project and teams were looking at feedback for any changes that needed to be made ahead of next season;
- bb) As temperatures continued to rise, weed control was an increasing issue with a team working on removal;
- cc) A total of 1034 trees needed to be pollarded over the winter, with 5800 new trees due to be planted;

Councillor Pat Patel (Cabinet Member for Customer Services, Culture, Leisure & Sport) provided an update and highlighted –



dd) The Box received the John Bracey Building of the Year Award 2022.

20. **Month 6 Financial Monitoring Report**

Councillor Mark Shayer (Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member for Finance and Economy) introduced the Month 6 Financial Monitoring Report. This was seconded by The Leader.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Mark Lowry and Nick Kelly, the Council agreed to –

- I) Note the report.

*Councillor Dr John Mahony arrived at 2.55pm.*

21. **Climate Emergency Planning Statement**

Councillor Rebecca Smith (Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning, Homes and Communities) introduced the Climate Emergency Planning Statement. This was seconded by Councillor James Stoneman.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Stevens and Nicholson, the Council agreed to –

- I) Adopt the Plymouth and South West Devon Climate Emergency Planning Statement as an interim policy statement, pending completion of the next review of the Plymouth and South West Devon Joint Local Plan 50 allow give formal weight to the Plymouth and South West Devon Climate Emergency Planning Statement as a material consideration in decision making on all new planning applications.

For (53)

Councillors Bingley, Burden, Carlyle, Churchill, Collins, Darcy, Deacon, Drean, Finn, Harrison, Hulme, Lugg, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith, Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin, Poyser, Wheeler, Kelly, Singh, Beer, Briars-Delve, Mrs Aspinall, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Dr Cree, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, McDonald, Murphy, Penberthy, Reilly, Rennie, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent.

Against (0)

Abstain (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (2)

Councillors Mrs Bridgeman, Loveridge,

*Councillor Haydon joined the meeting at 3.04pm.*

*Councillor Loveridge left the meeting at 3.07pm.*

22. **Local Government Pensions Scheme Discretions Policy (to follow)**

Councillor Mark Shayer (Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member for Finance and Economy) introduced the Local Government Pensions Scheme Discretions Policy. This was seconded by Councillor Mark Lowry.

The Council agreed to –

- 1) Approve the Local Government Pension Scheme (LGPS) Discretions Policy with the recommended discretions, to be applied to current scheme members, employees eligible for scheme membership or previous scheme members.

For (51)

Councillors Bingley, Burden, Carlyle, Churchill, Collins, Darcy, Deacon, Drear, Finn, Harrison, Hulme, Lugger, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin, Poyser, Wheeler, Kelly, Mrs Beer, Mrs Aspinall, Briars-Delve, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, McDonald, Murphy, Penberthy, Reilly, Rennie, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent.

Against (0)

Abstain (2)

Councillor Mrs Beer, Nicholson.

Absent/Did Not Vote (2)

Councillors Mrs Bridgeman, Singh.

*Councillor Singh left the meeting at 3.11pm.*

*Councillor Loveridge re-joined the meeting at 3.15pm.*

23. **Treasury Management outturn report 2021/22**

Councillor Andy Lugger (Chair of Audit and Governance Committee) introduced the Treasury Management Outturn Report 2021/22. This was seconded by Councillor Mark Lowry.

Following a discussion with a contribution from Councillor Wheeler the Council agreed to –

- 1) Approve the Treasury Management Annual Report 2021/22 in order to comply with the CIPFA Code of Practice and discharge statutory requirement.

For (54)

Councillors Bingley, Burden, Carlyle, Churchill, Collins, Darcy, Deacon, Drear, Finn, Harrison, Hulme, Lugger, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin, Poyser, Wheeler,

Kelly, Mrs Beer, Mrs Aspinall, Briars-Delve, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, McDonald, Murphy, Penberthy, Reilly, Rennie, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent.

Against (0)

Abstain (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (1)  
Councillor Mrs Bridgeman.

*Councillor Singh re-joined the meeting at 3.19pm.*

#### 24. **Electoral Cycle Public Consultation**

Councillor Andy Lugg (Chair of Audit and Governance Committee) introduced the Electoral Cycle Public Consultation report. This was seconded by Councillor Mark Shayer.

Following a discussion with a contributions from Councillors Kelly, Stoneman and Singh the Council agreed –

- 1) To a public engagement consultation is undertaken using powers under Section 116 of the Local Government Act 2003 between June and August 2023 on the issue of moving from the current electoral cycle of elections to ‘whole council’ elections once every four years;
- 2) That the Audit and Governance Committee would oversee and agree the design and implementation of the consultation, in particular who would be consulted/engaged with and how;
- 3) That the council confirms that the Boundary Commission Review commences in December 2023 and is conducted across 2024/25 with resulting arrangements implemented in 2026.

For (54)

Councillors Bingley, Burden, Carlyle, Churchill, Collins, Darcy, Deacon, Drear, Finn, Harrison, Hulme, Lugg, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin, Poyser, Wheeler, Kelly, Mrs Beer, Mrs Aspinall, Briars-Delve, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, McDonald, Murphy, Penberthy, Reilly, Rennie, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent.

Against (0)

Abstain (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (1)  
Councillor Mrs Bridgeman.

#### 25. **Approval of Councillor Absence (to follow)**

This item was withdrawn.

26. **Changes to the Constitution**

Councillor James Stoneman (Cabinet Member for Climate Change) introduced the report on Changes to the Constitution. This was seconded by Councillor Pat Patel.

The Council agreed to –

- 1) The amendment to the Licensing Committee Terms of Reference as set out in Appendix 1 of the report to delegate the responsibility to approve Animal Licensing Policy;
- 2) The amendment to the Appointment of Proper Officers Table as set out in Appendix 2 of the report.

For (54)

Councillors Bingley, Burden, Carlyle, Churchill, Collins, Darcy, Deacon, Drean, Finn, Harrison, Hulme, Lugg, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin, Poyser, Wheeler, Kelly, Mrs Beer, Mrs Aspinall, Briars-Delve, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, McDonald, Murphy, Penberthy, Reilly, Rennie, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent.

Against (0)

Abstain (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (1)

Councillors Mrs Bridgeman and Darcy.

*Councillor Darcy left the meeting at 3.33pm.*

27. **Motions on notice**

**(i) Dental Services in Plymouth**

Councillor Mrs Mary Aspinall introduced the motion on notice on Dental Services in Plymouth. This was seconded by Councillor Dr John Mahony.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Laing, Shayer, Kelly and Finn.

The Council agreed –

- 1) That a joint letter would be sent from the Chairs of the Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee and the Health and Wellbeing Board to the Parliamentary Under Secretary of State for Community Health and Care and to the Senior Leadership of NHS England expressing the

views set out in the motion on notice.

For (54)

Councillors Bingley, Burden, Carlyle, Churchill, Collins, Darcy, Deacon, Drean, Finn, Harrison, Hulme, Luggar, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith, Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin, Poyser, Wheeler, Kelly, Mrs Beer, Singh, Mrs Aspinall, Briars-Delve, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, McDonald, Murphy, Penberthy, Reilly, Rennie, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent.

Against (0)

Abstain (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (1)

Councillor Mrs Bridgeman.

*Councillor Darcy re-joined the meeting at 15.45pm.*

*Councillor Charlotte Carlyle left the meeting at 4.00pm.*

**(ii) Action to tackle violence against women and girls in Plymouth**

The Lord Mayor proposed a moment of reflection ahead of this motion on notice, as it had been a year since the death of Bobby McLeod.

Councillor Charlotte Holloway introduced the motion on notice for Action to Tackle Violence Against Women and Girls in Plymouth. This was seconded by Councillor Zoe Reilly.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Mrs Beer, Tippetts, Smith, Stoneman and Collins the Council agreed to –

- 1) The production of a clear action plan on how the Commission's recommendations will be taken forward, outlining the commitment of resources, who is responsible and the timescales for delivery;
- 2) Providing an update on activities undertaken by the Council on this area since the Commission's report in May 2022 in addition to an update on the agreed actions in the January 2022 motion at Full Council;
- 3) Develop and implement a public communications plan to the people of Plymouth on how recommendations will be implemented and explaining in practical terms how women and girls' lives will be safer as a result, including messaging to men and boys on how they can be an ally in tackling VAWG;
- 4) Write to the new Home Secretary to request additional national Government funding to deliver on recommendations;

- 5) Request that the Police and Crime Commissioner publishes misogyny in crime statistics across Devon and Cornwall Police, including for Plymouth alongside the regular publication of other hate crime figures.

For (54)

Councillors Bingley, Burden, Churchill, Collins, Darcy, Deacon, Drear, Finn, Harrison, Hulme, Lugg, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith, Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin, Poyser, Wheeler, Kelly, Mrs Beer, Singh, Mrs Bridgeman, Mrs Aspinall, Briars-Delve, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, McDonald, Murphy, Penberthy, Reilly, Rennie, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent.

Against (0)

Abstain (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (1)  
Councillor Carlyle.

*Councillor Mrs Bridgeman joined the meeting at 4.30pm.*

### **(iii) School Uniform**

Councillor Tom Briars-Delve introduced the motion on notice on School Uniform. This was seconded by Councillor Sally Cresswell.

Following contributions from Councillor Smith, Bingley, Mrs Beer, Kelly and Singh the Council agreed –

- 1) That the Cabinet Member for Education, Skills and Children and Young People will write to every school in Plymouth requesting further information on their uniform policy:
  - Recent reviews in light of statutory guidance;
  - Branded items from single suppliers;
  - The average cost of a school uniform and PE kit;
  - Additional support, second-hand options and promotion of local charities;
- 2) Responses to the Cabinet Member's letter will be presented and considered at the next Education and Children's Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Committee. This will enable the committee to explore other ways that the Council can support families;

- 3) The Council's Cost of Living Support hub and social media channels will signpost families to local charities supplying free school uniforms.

For (54)

Councillors Bingley, Burden, Churchill, Collins, Darcy, Deacon, Drean, Finn, Harrison, Hulme, Luggar, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith, Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin, Poyser, Wheeler, Kelly, Mrs Beer, Mrs Bridgeman, Singh, Mrs Aspinall, Briars-Delve, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, McDonald, Murphy, Penberthy, Reilly, Rennie, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent.

Against (0)

Abstain (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (1)  
Councillor Carlyle.

*Councillor Loveridge left the meeting at 5.35pm.*

#### **(iv) Cost of Living**

Councillor Rebecca Smith (Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning, Homes and Communities) proposed the motion on notice on Cost of Living. Councillor Natalie Harrison seconded this motion.

Councillor Jemima Laing moved an amendment to the motion. This was seconded by Councillor Zoe Reilly.

*The meeting was adjourned from 5.40pm until 5.50pm.*

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillor Smith, Kelly, Penberthy, Harrison the Council agreed to accept the amendment.

For (29)

Councillors Hulme, Poyser, Wheeler, Kelly, Mrs Beer, Singh, Mrs Bridgeman, Briars-Delve, Mrs Aspinall, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, McDonald, Murphy, Penberthy, Reilly, Rennie, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent.

Against (23)

Councillors Bingley, Burden, Churchill, Collins, Darcy, Deacon, Drean, Finn, Harrison, Luggar, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith, Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin.

Abstain (1)  
Councillor Dann.

Absent/Did Not Vote (2)  
Councillors Carlyle and Loveridge.

Councillor George Wheeler moved an amendment to the motion. This was seconded by Councillor Ian Poyser.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Evans OBE, Nicholson and Riley the Council agreed to accept the amendment.

For (27)  
Councillors Poyser, Wheeler, Kelly, Mrs Beer, Singh, Briars-Delve, Mrs Aspinall, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, McDonald, Murphy, Penberthy, Reilly, Rennie, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent.

Against (24)  
Councillors Bingley, Burden, Churchill, Collins, Darcy, Deacon, Drean, Finn, Harrison, Hulme, Luggier, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith, Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin,

Abstain (2)  
Councillor Dann and Mrs Bridgeman.

Absent/Did Not Vote (2)  
Councillors Carlyle and Loveridge.

The Council agreed to note –

- 1) The significant impact current energy costs, interest rates and other financial pressures are having on citizens in Plymouth;
- 2) The existing partnership work which was already taking place across the city to tackle poverty and support the most vulnerable. Further the Council places on record its gratitude to our voluntary and community sector and social enterprise partners working tirelessly in this field;
- 3) The Cost of Living Taskforce which had been set up to ensure a successful track record of collaboration and partnership continues as they work together to deal with the increased pressures of the cost of living on families, individuals and businesses across the city;

This Council therefore:

- 4) Pledged to proactively identify those most in need of support and to ensure they had access to all the Government support they were eligible for and to distribute government funding such as the Household Support Fund as creatively and effectively as possible to reach those most in need;



- 5) Committed to providing leadership and support across the city to ensure that the impact of the cost of living crisis was minimised for all those living in Plymouth- by:
- a. Declaring a cost-of-living emergency;
  - b. Instructing Cllr Rebecca Smith (the Cabinet member responsible) to work with her opposite numbers in the other three groups in Council and members of the Cost of Living Taskforce to develop Terms of Reference that would make the work cross-party and ensure that the Taskforce is able to challenge the Council, it's partners and the government on issues relating to the cost of living emergency without fear of repercussions;
  - c. Requested the Chief Executive write to the new Chancellor and Prime Minister urging them to create a Local Government Cost of Living Emergency Fund to help local authorities, including Plymouth, to tackle the crisis;
- 6) Welcomed the increased funding for adult social care proposed in the Chancellor's Statement but noted with regret that much of it was to be raised by allowing the Council to increase council tax by up to 4.99% before a referendum was called;
- 7) Note -
- a. That increasing council tax produces less funding in poorer areas like Plymouth than in wealthier ones while the greater need is in the former;
  - b. That increasing council tax by 4.99% would add to the financial pressures on the citizens of Plymouth, described in earlier paragraphs;
  - c. Resolved to write to the Chancellor to request he found a fairer way of funding the increase in adult social care provision than through increasing council tax.

**For (29)**

Councillors Hulme, Poyser, Wheeler, Kelly, Mrs Beer, Singh, Mrs Bridgeman, Briars-Delve, Mrs Aspinall, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, McDonald, Murphy, Penberthy, Reilly, Rennie, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent.

**Against (0)**

**Abstain (24)**

Councillors Bingley, Burden, Churchill, Collins, Darcy, Deacon, Drean, Finn, Harrison, Luggar, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith, Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin and Dann.

Absent/Did Not Vote (2)  
Councillors Carlyle and Loveridge.

*Councillors Burden and Collins left the meeting at 6.40pm.*

**(v) Re-use Partnership**

Councillor Ian Poyser introduced the motion on notice on Re-Use Partnership. This was seconded by Councillor George Wheeler.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Briars-Delve, Harrison, Stoneman, Kelly, Mrs Bridgeman and Wakeham the Council agreed to –

- I) Work with partners in the retailer, housing associations, charities, education provides and existing reuse businesses to take a lead on supporting reuse within the city by establishing a 'Reuse Partnership' stimulating the green economy, creating skilled jobs and affordable reusable items for householders.

For (51)

Councillors Bingley, Churchill, Darcy, Deacon, Drear, Finn, Harrison, Hulme, Luggar, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith, Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin, Poyser, Wheeler, Kelly, Mrs Beer, Singh, Mrs Bridgeman, Mrs Aspinall, Briars-Delve, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, McDonald, Murphy, Penberthy, Reilly, Rennie, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent.

Against (0)

Abstain (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (4)  
Councillors Burden, Carlyle, Collins and Loveridge.

**(vi) Cost of Living Emergency Declaration**

This item was withdrawn from the agenda.

**(vii) Absence of Councillors**

Councillor Mrs Terri Beer introduced the motion on notice on Absence of Councillors. This was seconded by Councillor Chaz Singh.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Laing, Smith, Evans OBE, Wheeler, Kelly and Nicholson the Council agreed to –

- I) To request Councillor Shannon Burden and Councillor Dan Collins to resign their seats on Plymouth City Council with immediate effect, to allow two local representatives to be elected to represent these important communities on the Council.

For (31)

Councillors Darcy, Hulme, Nicholson, Partridge, Poyser, Kelly, Mrs Beer, Singh, Mrs Bridgeman, Mrs Aspinall, Briars-Delve, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, McDonald, Murphy, Penberthy, Reilly, Rennie, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent.

Against (0)

Abstain (20)

Councillors Bingley, Churchill, Deacon, Drear, Finn, Harrison, Lugger, Dr Mahony, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith, Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin, Wheeler, Dann.

Absent/Did Not Vote (4)

Councillors Burden, Carlyle, Collins and Loveridge.

#### **(viii) Elections Act 2022**

Councillor Tudor Evans OBE introduced the motion on notice on the Elections Act 2022. This was seconded by Councillor Mark Coker.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Finn, Stoneman, Kelly, Singh and Wheeler, The Council agreed to –

- I) Formally register its opposition to the timetable and supported the postponement of the implementation until May 2024.

For (24)

Councillors Poyser, Wheeler, Mrs Aspinall, Briars-Delve, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, McDonald, Murphy, Penberthy, Reilly, Rennie, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy and Vincent.

Against (23)

Councillors Bingley, Churchill, Darcy, Deacon, Drear, Finn, Harrison, Hulme, Lugger, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith, Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin and Mrs Bridgeman.

Abstain (4)

Councillors Kelly, Mrs Beer, Singh and Dann.

Absent/Did Not Vote (4)

Councillors Burden, Carlyle, Collins and Loveridge.

#### **28. Urgent Key Decisions to be reported**

The Leader introduced the report and following a discussion with a contribution from Councillor Coker, The Council agreed to –

I) Note the report.

29. **Questions by Councillors**

	<b>From</b>	<b>To</b>	<b>Subject</b>
1	Councillor Churchill	Councillor Drean	Dawes Lane Cycle Lane
	Response: The relevant team had been looking into this and had come up with some alternatives, some of which include going on private land, so negotiations were ongoing. The teams were talking to local cycling groups about the options.		
2	Councillor Mrs Aspinall	Councillor Wakeham	Tree Pruning affecting Leaf Litter
	Response: The teams were approaching this issue the best they could, they were acting when there is a higher volume with leaf litter.		
	Supplementary: Tree Pruning of overly large trees		
	Response: Councillor Wakeham asked for the email to be forwarded and he would look into whether it could be prioritised in the order of pruning works due for Winter 2022/23.		
3	Councillor Briars-Delve	Councillor Drean	Pedestrian Safety on busy junctions and school routes
	Response: Councillor Drean agreed that pedestrian safety on bus junctions and school routes should be key priorities when allocating funding for highways projects.		
	Supplementary: The Millbridge Crossroads on Molesworth Road had had eight collisions in recent years and had 5 nearby schools; a pedestrian crossing scheme had been design but cancelled due to budget issues.		
	Response: Councillor Drean explained that crossings are normally so expensive due to the utilities beneath the surface and the need for special paving. Councillor Drean agreed to a site visit		
4	Councillor Coker	Councillor Drean	Ability to deal with heavy rainfall in comparison to 2019
	Response: Councillor Drean explained that the biggest challenge was the volume of leaves and he had asked for more letterbox gullies to be put in to help with the issue.		
	Supplementary: Several drains and areas were repeatedly flooding.		
	Response: The Council was working with South West Water and the		

	Environmental Agency. Cameras were being put down these drains to see where the physical problems were within.		
5	Councillor Poyser	Councillor Drean	Armada Way Trees Consultation
	Response: Councillor Drean had met with the group already to explain the situation and he would be talking to the tree experts about the scheme and would be happy to meet with them again if necessary once he had that information.		
6	Councillor Singh	Councillor Drean	Dale Road/Beechwood Avenue Flooding Hotspot
	Response: Councillor Drean would be happy to attend a site visit with Councillor Singh and members of the Highways team. Councillor Drean further explained that there were sometimes issues for teams with parked cars etc when trying to clear drains.		
	Supplementary: Do the Highways Team try to visit at times when cars are less likely to be parked at the location?		
	Response: The Highways team had two reactive vehicles with a third vehicle doing reactive and emergency.		
7	Councillor Kelly	The Leader	Councillor Code of Conduct
	Response: The same time the previous year The Leader had wanted Councillor Kelly to resign.		
8	Councillor Goslin	Councillor Drean	Lessons learnt from consultation on removal of trees on Armada Way
	Response: the project had begun in 2018, picked up by Councillor Drean in 2021. He would continue to engage with the public.		
	Supplementary: 84% agreed with the plans, but how many people were consulted in total?		
	Response: Councillor Drean agreed to find out the information and send it over to Councillor Goslin outside of the meeting.		
9	Councillor Nicholson	Councillor Smith	Housing Associations responded to complaints from tenants and actions taken.
	Response: Following the findings in Rochdale, the Council would be ensuring they had all the relevant procedures in place to ensure the same situation never happened in Plymouth. There was a robust complaints procedure and in response to a letter received from the Secretary of State, the Council would be analysing what was going on across the city to ensure that housing associations were doing exactly as they should be to ensure that living in a housing association property was safe.		
	Supplementary: Briefing Note to all Councillors on the subject		
	Response: Councillor Smith agreed to provide all Councillors with a briefing note.		
10	Councillor	The Leader	£150 Parking Bay Proposals

	Holloway		
	<p>Response: The Leader did not agree with local charities who had described the proposed £150 parking bay proposals as a “disability tax”. There was a substantial budget deficit of £37 million and had the Cabinet had looked at various money-raising initiatives and savings which had been sent to scrutiny. Over 300 services across the Council would likely be severely impacted by the savings that had to be made in unprecedented time in terms of finance for local government.</p> <p>Supplementary: Impact Assessments with disability focus</p> <p>Response: Equality Impact Assessments are carried out and would cover disabilities. The Leader would review to see if more could be done, but explained he was currently satisfied with the process. The Leader asked Councillor Holloway to get in touch via email about any specific services.</p>		
11	Councillor Haydon	Councillor Wakeham	Weston Mill to be opened full time as promised in the manifesto.
	Response: Weston Mill would be kept open at its current times, it was running well and local residents were in general very happy.		
12	Councillor Hulme	Councillor Patel	Enforcement of illegal parking in Taxi Ranks
	Response: Councillor Patel suggested that if taxi drivers find members of the public parked illegally in their ranks that they take the number plate and report it to the Police		
13	Councillor Laing	Councillor Patel	Contact Centre Emergency Line
	<p>Response: Councillor Patel was not aware of the wait time that morning.</p> <p>Supplementary: Councillor Laing has been cut off 7 times whilst trying to report flooding on the emergency line – how can residents report emergencies if the number is not working?</p> <p>Response: Councillor Patel agreed that it was unacceptable and an alternative way of reporting emergency issues was being looked into.</p>		
14	Councillor Mrs Aspinall	Councillor Drean	Changes to Bus Routes to be advertised further than online
	Response: Councillor Drean had hoped this was going to be done by the bus companies as they had opted not to use Mayflower Street whilst works were underway by he would speak to them to try and rectify this.		
15	Councillor Coker	Councillor Wakeham	Leaf Fall prioritisation in residential areas
	<p>Response: Areas were being prioritised due to pressures and availability.</p> <p>Supplementary: Areas had been prioritised, but there had been reports of several residents falling.</p> <p>Response: The team is doing their best, but leaf fall is persistent. Areas are be prioritised. Councillor Wakeham offered to look into the area Councillor</p>		

	Coker was referring to.		
16	Councillor Poyser	Councillor Patel	Blue Badge Application Delays
	<p>Response: Councillor Patel confirmed he was aware of the issue but the badges were completed through a Gov.UK website, which is where the delay was.</p> <p>Supplementary: Awareness of this for residents.</p> <p>Response: Councillor Patel would provide clarity on the process for Councillors.</p>		
	Councillor Singh	Councillor Drean	Daytime Bus Services being cut but there was a bus serving the night time economy
17	<p>Response: Councillor Drean clarified that the bus that was being put on Saturday Nights was not funded by the Council, it had been funded through Safer Streets. The difficulties with the budget mean difficult decisions have had to be made and therefore some routes have to be changed and some cancelled. 9 out of 14 routes were kept. Councillor Drean was speaking to bus companies about routes to serve communities who could be isolated by these decisions, but the decision was made based on patronage numbers.</p> <p>Supplementary: When decisions are taken with regards to cutting services such as bus services could a consultation take place with ward councillors and the community?</p> <p>Response: Conversations were taking place to help better serve residents with bus routes with bus companies following feedback from the public and Councillors.</p>		
	Councillor Mrs Beer	Councillor Bingley	Apology to Former Lord Mayor following a leaked telephone conversation
18	<p>Response: Councillor Bingley questioned the date of the event mentioned in the question as it was in the month before the telephone conversation was leaked.</p> <p>Councillor Beer explained the event in question was at Boringdon Golf Club in approximately March.</p>		
	Councillor Coker	Councillor Drean	Tendered Bus Services withdrawal due to budget savings
19	<p>Response: Some quotes for tendered services have been double what they have been in the past. There was a benchmark of £2 per passenger on the NCR with new contracts quoting £4-£18. Budget constraints as well as patronage had been considered when making the decision.</p> <p>Supplementary: Were savings being made that could otherwise be used for concessionary or subsidised bus routes?</p> <p>Response: The decisions had considered based on budget and patronage and were out for consultation. Councillor Drean offered to share more information when it was available.</p>		

*Please note that questions, answers, supplementary questions and supplementary answers have been summarised.*